

**THE TEXT OF THE STATEMENT BY AMERICAN SCHOLARS AND
HISTORIANS ADDRESSED TO THE U.S. HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES
(Published in New York Times on May 19,1985)**

“ATTENTION
MEMBERS OF THE U.S. HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

The undersigned American academicians who specialize in Turkish, Ottoman and Middle Eastern Studies are concerned that the current language embodied in House Joint Resolution 192 is misleading and/or inaccurate in several respects.

Specifically, while fully supporting the concept of a "*National Day of Remembrance of Man's Inhumanity to Man*," we respectfully take exception to that portion of the text which singles out for special recognition:

"... the one and one half million people of Armenian ancestry who were victims of genocide perpetrated in Turkey between 1915 and 1923 . . ."

Our reservations focus on the use of the words "*Turkey*" and "*genocide*" and may be summarized as follows:

From the fourteenth century until 1922, the area currently known as Turkey, or more correctly, the Republic of Turkey, was part of the territory encompassing the multinational, multi-religious state known as the Ottoman Empire. It is wrong to equate the Ottoman Empire with the Republic of Turkey in the same way that it is wrong to equate the Hapsburg Empire with the Republic of Austria. The Ottoman Empire, which was brought to an end in 1922, by the successful conclusion of the Turkish Revolution which established the present day Republic of Turkey in 1923, incorporated lands and people which today account for more than twenty-five distinct countries in Southeastern Europe, North Africa, and the Middle East, only one of which is the Republic of Turkey. The Republic of Turkey bears no responsibility for any events which occurred in Ottoman times, yet by naming 'Turkey' in the Resolution, its authors have implicitly labeled it as guilty of "*genocide*" it charges transpired between 1915 and 1923;

As for the charge of "*genocide*" no signatory of this statement wishes to minimize the scope of Armenian suffering. We are likewise cognizant that it cannot be viewed as separate from the suffering experienced by the Muslim inhabitants of the region. The weight of evidence so far uncovered points in the direct of serious inter communal warfare (perpetrated by Muslim and Christian irregular forces), complicated by disease, famine, suffering and massacres in Anatolia and adjoining areas during the First World War. Indeed, throughout the years in question, the region was the scene of more or less continuous warfare, not unlike the tragedy which has gone on in Lebanon for the past decade. The resulting death toll among both Muslim and Christian communities of the region was immense. But much more remains to be discovered before historians will be able to sort out precisely responsibility between warring and innocent, and to identify the causes for the events which resulted in the death or removal of large numbers of the eastern Anatolian population, Christian and Muslim alike.

Statesmen and politicians make history, and scholars write it. For this process to work scholars must be given access to the written records of the statesmen and politicians of the past. To date, the relevant archives in the Soviet Union, Syria, Bulgaria and Turkey all remain, for the most part, closed to dispassionate historians. Until they become available, the history of the Ottoman Empire in the period encompassed by H.J. Res. 192 (1915-1923) cannot be adequately known.

We believe that the proper position for the United States Congress to take on this and related issues is to encourage full and open access to all historical archives and not to make charges on historical events before they are fully understood. Such charges as those contained H.J. Res. 192 would inevitably reflect unjustly upon the people of Turkey and perhaps set back progress irreparably. Historians are just now beginning to achieve in understanding these tragic events.

As the above comments illustrate, the history of the Ottoman-Armenians is much debated among scholars, many of whom do not agree with the historical assumptions embodied in the wording of H.J. Res. 192. By passing the resolution Congress will be attempting to determine by legislation which side of the historical question is correct. Such a resolution, based on historically questionable assumptions, can only damage the cause of honest historical inquiry, and damage the credibility of the American legislative process.”

SIGNATORIES TO THE STATEMENT ON H.J. RES. 192 ADDRESSED TO THE MEMBERS OF THE U.S. HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

RIFAAT ABOU-EL-HAJ

Professor of History

California State University at Long Beach

SARAH MOMENT ATIS

Professor of Turkish Language & Literature

University of Wisconsin at Madison

KARL BARBIR

Associate Professor of History

Siena College (New York)

ILHAN BASGOZ

Director of the Turkish Studies Program at the Department of Uralic & Altaic Studies Indiana University

DANIEL G. BATES

Professor of Anthropology Hunter College, City University of New York

ULKU BATES

Professor of Art History Hunter College City University of New York

GUSTAV BAYERLE

Professor of Uralic & Altaic Studies

Indiana University

ANDREAS G. E. BODROGLIGETTI

Professor of Turkic & Iranian languages University of California at Los Angeles

KATHLEEN BURRILL

Associate Professor of Turkish Studies

Columbia University

RODERIC DAVISON

Professor of History

George Washington University

WALTER DENNY

Associate Professor of Art History &

Near Eastern Studies

University of Massachusetts

DR. ALAN DUBEN

Anthropologist, Researcher New York City

ELLEN ERVIN

Research Assistant Professor of Turkish

New York University

CAESAR FARAH

Professor of Islamic & Middle Eastern History University of Minnesota

CARTER FINDLEY

Associate Professor of History The Ohio State University

MICHAEL FINEFROCK
Professor of History College of Charleston

ALAN FISHER
Professor of History Michigan State University

CORNELL FLEISCHER
Assistant Professor of History Washington University (Missouri)

TIMOTHY CHILDS
Professorial Lecturer at SAIS, Johns Hopkins University

SHAFIGA DAULET
Associate Professor of Political Science
University of Connecticut

JUSTIN MCCARTHY
Associate Professor of History University of Louisville

JON MANDAVILLE
Professor of the History
of the Middle East
Portland State University (Oregon)

RHOADS MURPHEY
Assistant Professor of Middle Eastern Languages & Cultures & History Columbia University

PIERRE OBERLING
Professor of History
Hunter College of the City University of New York

ROBERT OLSON
Associate Professor of History
University of Kentucky

DONALD QUATAERT
Associate Professor of History University of Houston

WILLIAM GRISWOLD
Professor of History Colorado State University

WILLIAM HICKMAN
Associate Professor of Turkish University of California, Berkeley
Professor of History Glenville State College West Virginia

RALPH JAECKEL
Visiting Assistant Professor of Turkish
University of California at Los Angeles

JAMES KELLY
Associate Professor of Turkish
University of Utah

PETER GOLDEN
Professor of History Rutgers University, Newark

TOM GOODRICH
Professor of History
Indiana University of Pennsylvania

ANDREW COULD
Ph.D. in Ottoman History Flagstaff, Arizona

MICHAEL MEEKER
Professor of Anthropology University of California at San Diego

THOMAS NAFF
Professor of History & Director, Middle East Research Institute University of Pennsylvania

WILLIAM OCHSENWALD
Associate Professor of History Virginia Polytechnic Institute

WILLIAM PEACHY
Assistant Professor of the Judaic & Near
Eastern Languages & Literatures
The Ohio State University

HOWARD REED
Professor of History University of Connecticut

TIBOR HALASI-KUN
Professor Emeritus of Turkish Studies

Columbia University
J. C. HUREWITZ
Professor of Government Emeritus Former Director of the Middle East Institute (1971-1984) Columbia University
HALIL INALCIK
University Professor of Ottoman History & Member of the American Academy of Arts & Sciences
University of Chicago
RONALD JENNINGS
Associate Professor of History & Asian Studies University of Illinois
KERIM KEY
Adjunct Professor Southeastern University Washington, D.C.
DANKWART RUSTOW
Distinguished University Professor of
Political Science City University Graduate School New York
STANFORD SHAW
Professor of History University of California at Los Angeles
METIN KUNT
Professor of Ottoman History New York City
AVIGDOR LEVY
Professor of History Brandeis University
DR. HEATH W. LOWRY
Institute of Turkish Studies Inc. Washington, D.C.
JOHN MASSON SMITH, JR.
Professor of History
University of California at Berkeley
ROBERT STAAB
Assistant Director of the Middle East Center University of Utah
JAMES STEWARD-ROBINSON
Professor of Turkish Studies University of Michigan
FRANK TACHAU
Professor of Political Science University of Illinois at Chicago
DAVID THOMAS
Associate Professor of History Rhode Island College
WARREN S. WALKER
Home Professor of English & Director of the Archive of Turkish Oral Narrative
Texas Tech University
WALTER WEIKER
Professor of Political Science Rutgers University
MADELINE ZILFI
Associate Professor of History University of Maryland
ELAINE SMITH
Ph.D. in Turkish History Retired Foreign Service Officer Washington, D.C.
Associate Professor of History California State University, Northridge
FREDERICK LATIMER
Associate Professor of History (Retired)
University of Utah
BERNARD LEWIS
Cleveland E. Dodge Professor of Near Eastern History Princeton University
GRACE M. SMITH
Visiting Lecturer in Turkish University of California at Berkeley
DR. SVAT SOUCEK
Turcologist, New York City
JUNE STARR
Associate Professor of Anthropology
SUNY Stony Brook
DR. PHILIP STODDARD
Executive Director, Middle East Institute Washington, D.C.
METIN TAMKOC
Professor of International Law and Regulations Texas Tech University

MARGARET L. VENZKE

Assistant Professor of History Dickinson College (Pennsylvania)

DONALD WEBSTER

Professor of Turkish History, Retired

JOHN WOODS

Associate Professor of Middle Eastern
History

University of Chicago